

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: March 10, 2021

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Commissioners absent: Jennie West

I. Minutes of the February 3, 2021 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

II. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Old Business Work Applications

A. 1238 Baronne St

Application: Replace existing slate roof on a Significant Rated building with an asphalt shingle roof.

Motion: Defer review of the application for 30 days per the applicant's request.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. New Business Work Applications

A. 1114 Treme St

Application: Removal of existing slate tile roofing on a contributing residential building to install HDLC Approved architectural asphalt shingles.

Motion: Approve the Application and retain the chimney and slate ridge tiles.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1223 Baronne St

Application: Replacement of existing door at front and garage door at rear of non-original garage addition.

Motion: Approve the application.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 1135 Barracks St

Application: Removal of existing terracotta tile roofing on an contributing residential building to install HDLC Approved architectural asphalt shingles.

Motion: Approve the Application.

By: Ayo Love

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Donna Wakemen, Annie Cambria

Opposed: Stephane Bruno, Lee Bressler, Jason King, Emily Bahr

Comments: S. Bruno: Expressed that this would be an unfortunate loss to replace the existing, historic pan tile roof shingles on a visible roof of a contributing building. This material is becoming extremely rare.

V. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 7823 Leake Ave

Application: Demolition of 100% of the roof and 25% of the primary facade of a contributing, one-story, single-family residential building for a second story addition.

Motion: Defer

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Stephane Bruno, Lee Bressler, Jason King, Emily Bahr

Opposed:
Comments:

B. 2909 Ursulines Ave

Application: Structural renovation of a contributing two-story residential building to include the removal of over 50% of the existing roof structure.

Motion: Approve the application.

By: Emilie Bahr

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 1117 Pine St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of existing one-story, single-family residential building for a camelback addition.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

D. 1000 Aline St

Application: Demolition of existing non-contributing one-story, multi-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 708 Austerlitz St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary façade, more than 50% of the exterior wall area and more than 50% of the roof structure of a contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a new front porch and rear addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof and exterior wall demolition and to deny the application for façade demolition due to the radical amount of historic building material required to be removed and because the proposed recessed porch is incompatible with the existing historic roof overhang. The proposed modification would also result in the demolition of the defining character of the historic Creole Cottage.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 428 Calhoun St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of a contributing two-story, single-family residential building for a camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 2610 Dauphine St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story residential rear accessory structure to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade with the provisos that the Certificate of Appropriateness will not be issued until the rear addition plans for the site have been approved and that the applicant salvage as much of the existing building materials as possible for reuse or donation.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 1230 Washington Ave

Application: Demolition of existing non-contributing two-story, single-family residential building to grade for planned new construction.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade with the provisos that the Certificate of Appropriateness will not be issued until the redevelopment plans for the site have been approved and that the redevelopment plans include the preservation of the existing historic retaining wall and steps which are fragments of the previously existing Robb mansion.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments: Shelly Landrieu spoke regarding the application.

VI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 1738 N Rampart St

Application: Retention of demolition to grade of contributing one-story, two-family rear residential structure (Building #2) in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness and new construction of a 1,200 SF rear one-story, multi-unit hotel building to match the previously existing residential structure.

Motion: Ratify the ARC recommendation for new construction approval and to approve the application for retention of demolition and levy a \$10,000 fine. The Commission levied this fine based on the discussion of the applicant's stated previous experience working in local historic districts, because the applicant could and

should have contacted HDLC staff before proceeding with the demolition work, to serve as a precedent that working without or in deviation of a CofA has consequences, and based on the HDLC Guidelines which state that the demolition of all or portions of historic resources are considered drastic actions because they change the character of the area and are generally not considered an appropriate option.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1425 Josephine St

Application: Retention of installation of solar panels without a CofA.

Motion: Deny

By: Ed de Montluzin

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Calvin Alexander, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Stephane Bruno, Lee Bressler, Jason King

Opposed: Emily Bahr, Heather Szapary

Comments:

C. 939-941 Thalia St

Application: Retention of new construction of side addition and awning of a one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Defer

By: Anne Redd

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Stephane Bruno, Lee Bressler, Jason King, Emily Bahr

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 1516-1518 Louisa St

Application: Retention of renovation work performed without a Certificate of Appropriateness including the removal of 4/4 double-hung wood windows and installation of inappropriate flush-mounted 6/6 vinyl single-hung windows with half-screens and internal muntins and retention of installation of inappropriate wood-grained Hardie window apron trims.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

E. 6322 Annunciation St

Application: Retention of excess roof demolition on a contributing one-story, two-family residential building for a camelback addition in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of excess roof demolition and to levy a fine of \$10,000. The Commission levied this fine based on the discussion of the applicant's previous request for full roof demolition being denied, because the current location of the camelback obscures the historic two-room setback required by the HDLC Guidelines, because the applicant could and should have contacted HDLC staff before proceeding with the additional roof demolition work, to serve as a precedent that working without or

in deviation of a CofA has consequences, and based on the HDLC Guidelines which state that the demolition of all or portions of historic resources are considered drastic actions because they change the character of the area and are generally not considered an appropriate option.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed: Ayo Love, Anne Redd

Comments:

VII. Other Business

A. Proposed revision to HDLC Design Guidelines Section 8-15 regarding metal shutters

Motion: Approve the proposed revisions to the HDLC Design Guidelines Section 8-15 regarding metal shutters.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Emily Bahr, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, February 3, 2021 Meeting

Motion: Approve the Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, February 3, 2021 meeting.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments: